



STATE HERITAGE REGISTER COMMITTEE

MEETING MINUTES

6 December 2022 | 9:00 AM – 1:20 PM

Meeting held in Room 15, Level 11, Building 4, Parramatta Square, 12 Darcy Street, Parramatta and via Teams videoconference.

ATTENDANCE

State Heritage Register Committee

The Hon Robyn Parker	Chair
Ms Colleen Morris	Deputy Chair
Dr Stephen Gapps	Member
Dr Wayne Johnson	Member
Mr Paul Knight	Member
Dr Brian Lindsay	Member
Ms Lisa Trueman	Member
Ms Natalie Vinton	Member

Apology

Mr Frank Howarth AM PSM	Alternate Member
-------------------------	------------------

External Presenters (Item 2.1)

Ms Rachel Josey	Operations & Special Projects Manager, Inner West Council
Mr Niall Macken	Team Leader - Heritage & Urban Design, Inner West Council
Ms Sharon Veal	Chief Executive Officer, GML Heritage

Heritage NSW

Mr Sam Kidman	Executive Director
Ms Anna London	A/Director Heritage Programs
Ms Elizabeth Owers	Director Customer Services (Item 5.1)
Dr Natalie Blake	A/Manager, Heritage Programs South (Items 3.1, 3.2, 3.3)
Ms Alexandra Boukouvalas	Aboriginal Team Leader Heritage Programs (Item 3.1)
Ms Mary Ann Hamilton	A/Manager, Heritage Programs North (Items 3.1, 4.1, 4.2)
Mr Harvey Johnston	Manager Heritage Programs (Item 4.3)
Ms Sonia Limeburner	Manager Strategy and Implementation (Items 2.1, 6, 7)
Ms Louise Prowse	Senior Heritage Officer (Item 3.2)
Mr Stuart Read	Senior Heritage Officer (Item 3.3)
Ms Margot Stuart	Senior Heritage Officer (Item 4.1)
Ms Jackie Taylor	Senior Heritage Officer (Item 4.3)

Secretariat

Ms Olgica Lenger	Manager Secretariat
Miss Linda Bugarin	Secretariat Officer

IN-CAMERA SESSION

This item is not minuted.

Item 1. Welcome and Formalities

Chair Robyn Parker opened the meeting at 9:00 AM and delivered an Acknowledgment of Country. It was noted there were no apologies and quorum had been met.

Item 1.1 Conflict of Interest Declarations

The Committee noted the following standing declarations:

- Robyn Parker: 2011-2015 Decisions
- Colleen Morris: National Trust of Australia
- Dr Wayne Johnson: Place Management NSW

The Committee also noted the following:

- Ms Colleen Morris has historic conflict of interest regarding Item 3.1 *Ravensthorpe Homestead Complex and its Setting*. Ms Morris will abstain from decision making and voting for this item.
- Ms Natalie Vinton declared a conflict of interest regarding Item 6.1 *SHR Nomination – The Powerhouse Museum (buildings and collection)*. Ms Vinton will leave the meeting for the duration of this item.
- Ms Lisa Trueman declared a conflict of interest regarding Item 6.2 *SHR Nomination – Villa Florida, Rose Bay*. Ms Trueman will leave the meeting for the duration of this item.
- Dr Wayne Johnson declared a conflict of interest regarding Item 6.3 *SHR Nomination – Australian Chinese Ex-Services Monument, Sydney*, which forms part of his standing declaration.

Item 1.2 Out of Session Decisions

Nil reported.

Item 1.3 Minutes from the Previous Meeting – 1 November 2022

Resolution 2022-68
The State Heritage Register Committee: 1. Confirmed the minutes of the previous ordinary meeting (1 November 2022) as a complete and accurate record of that meeting.
Moved by Ms Natalie Vinton and seconded by Ms Colleen Morris

Item 1.4 Matters Arising

Nil reported.

Item 1.5 Action Report

The State Heritage Register Committee noted the report.

Item 2. External Presentation

Item 2.1 Haberfield SHR Nomination – Inner West Council Presentation

The State Heritage Register Committee noted the presentation on Haberfield SHR Nomination by representatives from Inner West Council (IWC).

Paul Knight joined the meeting.

Key points noted in IWC presentation:

- The Council is seeking listing of Haberfield on the State Heritage Register:
 - 1) For recognition of the heritage values of Haberfield as a cultural landscape
 - 2) The listing has been sought by Council and community groups since 1999
 - 3) Haberfield has been identified on IWC's local strategic planning statement
 - 4) Listing will support the conservation management of Haberfield.
- IWC is seeking guidance from Heritage NSW on site-specific exemptions to ensure IWC can effectively manage the conservation of Haberfield and to finetune the Development Control Plan (DCP).

The Chair thanked the representatives from Inner West Council for their presentation.

Key points discussed:

- The Committee discussed the complexities associated with SHR listings of large cultural landscapes and noted that this category is one of the key proposals currently being investigated as part of the Heritage Act review.
- The Committee noted the IWC's willingness to support Heritage NSW in the potential listing of Haberfield and its subsequent management and regulation.
- The Committee discussed comparative study methodology, noting that Hunters Hill as a garden suburb is not referenced in the study and that the chronology should be further contextualised in the Statement of Significance.
- The Committee noted that Haberfield has been successfully managed by council for 25 years.

Item 3. SHR Nominations – Notice of Intention

Item 3.1 Ravensworth Homestead Complex and its Setting – NOI

The State Heritage Register Committee noted the presentation on Ravensworth Homestead Complex and its Setting – NOI by Ms Alexandra Boukouvalas and Ms Mary Ann Hamilton.

Key points noted:

- This cultural landscape listing has been a strategic priority for the Heritage Council since 2013.
- The Heritage Council has been advocating for its protection via input into the assessment process since 2018.
- The recent decision by the NSW Independent Planning Commission (IPC) to refuse Glencore's proposal to expand its Hunter Valley Glendell coal mine due to heritage concerns, provides the Heritage Council and Heritage NSW an opportunity to re-institute the listings process.
- The Committee discussed a request from Glencore to delay the listing considerations until after the expiry of the appeal process and to allow for an extended exhibition period. The Committee noted that the appeal process and SHR listing process are separate issues and considered procedural fairness in providing an extended exhibition time.

The Chair thanked Ms Alexandra Boukouvalas and the team for their work on the Ravensworth nomination.

Resolution 2022-69

The State Heritage Register Committee:

1. **Considers** the item known as *Ravensworth Homestead Complex and its Setting* at 346 Hebden Road, Singleton, defined in accordance with the curtilage shown at Tab 3.1C of the report, is likely to be of State heritage significance.
2. In accordance with section 33(1)(a) of the *Heritage Act 1977*, will **give** each person that it considers to be an affected owner or occupier written **notice** that it is going to consider whether or not to recommend the listing of the item concerned (a *Notice of Intention to Consider Listing*).
3. In accordance with section 33(1)(b) and section 33(1)(c) of the *Heritage Act 1977*, within 14 days after notice of intention to consider listing is given, will cause a **notice** of intention to consider listing to be **published** in a newspaper circulating in the area in which the item is situated, inviting submissions on the listing, specifying a date as the closing date for the receipt of submissions of 90 days after the publication of the newspaper notice and the manner in which submissions may be made.

Moved by Dr Wayne Johnson and seconded by Dr Stephen Gapps

Ms Colleen Morris abstained from decision making and voting for this agenda item.

Item 3.2 Plumwood, Monga - NOI

The State Heritage Register Committee noted the presentation on Plumwood, Monga – NOI by Ms Louise Prowse and Dr Natalie Blake.

Ms Lisa Trueman joined the meeting.

Key points noted:

- Heritage NSW recommended an exhibition period of 42 days to take into consideration the Christmas period.
- The Committee suggested that the heritage listed *Ahimsa* in Cheltenham (designed and built in 1937 by conservationist Marie Byles) is an important comparative example that could be considered in the Statement of Significance.
- The Committee noted that access to the main house crosses the National Parks and Wildlife Services' land. There is an existing Road Occupancy Permit Agreement in place to allow permanent access to Plumwood Mountain.
- The Committee expressed enthusiastic support for this nomination.

The Chair thanked Ms Louise Prowse for her presentation.

Resolution 2022-70

The State Heritage Register Committee:

1. **Considers** the item known as *Plumwood* at 4120 Kings Highway, Monga, defined in accordance with the curtilage shown at Tab 3.2C of the report, is likely to be of State heritage significance.

2. In accordance with section 33(1)(a) of the *Heritage Act 1977*, will **give** each person that it considers to be an affected owner or occupier written **notice** that it is going to consider whether or not to recommend the listing of the item concerned (a *Notice of Intention to Consider Listing*).
3. In accordance with section 33(1)(b) and section 33(1)(c) of the *Heritage Act 1977*, within 14 days after notice of intention to consider listing is given, will cause a **notice** of intention to consider listing to be **published** in a newspaper circulating in the area in which the item is situated, inviting submissions on the listing, specifying a date as the closing date for the receipt of submissions of 42 days after the publication of the newspaper notice and the manner in which submissions may be made.

Moved by Ms Colleen Morris and seconded by Ms Natalie Vinton

Item 3.3 Gooriwal Cultural Landscape - NOI

The State Heritage Register Committee noted the presentation on Gooriwal Cultural Landscape – NOI by Mr Stuart Read and Dr Natalie Blake.

Key points noted:

- Gooriwal Cultural Landscape nomination broadly comprises public reserves and Crown Lands.
- It was noted that some private landowners could not be contacted during the initial consultations.
- Heritage NSW recommended that the advertising period be extended to 42 days to take into consideration the Christmas period.
- The Committee noted that the Statement of Significance has been refined, while retaining the same content.

The Chair thanked Mr Stuart Read and Dr Natalie Blake for the presentation.

Resolution 2022-71

The State Heritage Register Committee:

1. **Considers** the item known as *Gooriwal Cultural Landscape*, being portions of Frenchmans and Yarra Bays, their two beaches and two public reserves, defined in accordance with the curtilage shown at Tab 3.3C of the report, is likely to be of State heritage significance.
2. In accordance with section 33(1)(a) of the *Heritage Act 1977*, will **give** each person that it considers to be an affected owner or occupier written **notice** that it is going to consider whether or not to recommend the listing of the item concerned (a *Notice of Intention to Consider Listing*).
3. In accordance with section 33(1)(b) and section 33(1)(c) of the *Heritage Act 1977*, within 14 days after notice of intention to consider listing is given, will cause a **notice** of intention to consider listing to be **published** in a newspaper circulating in the area in which the item is situated, inviting submissions on the listing, specifying a date as the closing date for the receipt of submissions of 42 days after the publication of the newspaper notice and the manner in which submissions may be made.

Moved by Ms Lisa Trueman and seconded by Dr Wayne Johnson

Item 4. SHR Nominations – Recommendation to List

Item 4.1 South Head Cultural Landscape (including RMP 9-inch 12-ton gun) – RTL

The State Heritage Register Committee noted the update on South Head Cultural Landscape (including RMP 9-inch 12-ton gun) – RTL by Ms Margot Stuart and Ms Mary Ann Hamilton.

Key points noted:

- During the exhibition period, there were 59 supporting submissions and two neutral submissions.
- In its submission, Woollahra Municipal Council requested site-specific exemptions for Camp Cove Beach, which have now been negotiated and included.
- Landowners who have not put in a written submission have been supportive and collaborative during the consultation process.
- The Aboriginal Land Council was supportive during the initial 2018 assessment period and was involved in two foundational documents which contributed significantly to Heritage NSW's understanding of the significance of the site.
- The Aboriginal Land Council has not responded to requests for consultation by Heritage NSW or ACHAC during 2022, however the Committee noted that the Aboriginal Land Council has longstanding and continued involvement both with council and National Parks and Wildlife Services.
- Two private owners of Camp Cove Beach have not responded to Heritage NSW's requests for consultation.
- After discussion, the Committee supported the curtilage as advertised which includes both parcels of private land.

The Chair thanked Ms Margot Stuart for her presentation.

Mr Paul Knight left the meeting.

Resolution 2022-72

The State Heritage Register Committee:

1. In accordance with section 33(1)(d) of the *Heritage Act 1977*, has **considered** the submissions received in response to its Notice of Intention to Consider Listing and considers the item known as *South Head Cultural Landscape (including RMP 9-inch 12-ton gun)* at Cliff Street, Watsons Bay, satisfies more than one of the approved criteria for determining whether an item is of State heritage significance, being criteria (a), (b), (c), (d), (e), (f), (g), as detailed in the report at Tab 4.1A.
2. **Recommends** to the Minister, in accordance with sections 32(1) and (2) of the *Heritage Act 1977*, that the Minister **direct** the listing of the item, *South Head Cultural Landscape (including RMP 9-inch 12-ton gun)* at Cliff Street, Watsons Bay, on the State Heritage Register, as advertised.
3. In accordance with section 33(1)(e) of the *Heritage Act 1977*, **give notice** of its decision to persons notified under section 33(1)(a).
4. In accordance with section 57(2) of the *Heritage Act 1977*, **recommends** that the Minister **grant** the site-specific exemptions at Tab 4.1D of the report from section 57(1) of the *Heritage Act 1977* in addition to the Heritage Council Standard Exemptions.

Moved by Dr Brian Lindsay and seconded by Ms Colleen Morris

Item 4.2 Manly Warringah War Memorial Park – RTL

The State Heritage Register Committee noted the update on Manly Warringah War Memorial Park – RTL by Ms Mary Ann Hamilton.

Key points noted:

- Ninety-nine submissions were received, all in support of this listing. Eight submissions requested the addition of the Aquatic Reserve to the listing, however local council confirmed its decision to exclude the Aquatic Reserve, for management reasons. The recommended curtilage remains the same as advertised.
- On request from local council, the title of the listing has been changed to align with the 2014 Plan of Management, by excluding the word ‘State’.
- Site-specific exemptions have been negotiated with Northern Beaches Council and Wakehurst Golf Club to enable existing management and recreational activities to continue.
- Crown Lands holds the title to Manly Warringah War Memorial Park and supports the listing.
- Heritage NSW confirmed the address of the listing is Kings Road, Manly Vale and it will amend the mapping accordingly.
- Ms Mary Ann Hamilton acknowledged and thanked Ms Judith Coombes for her hard work.

The Chair thanked Ms Mary Ann Hamilton and Ms Judith Coombes for their work on this item.

Resolution 2022-73

The State Heritage Register Committee:

1. In accordance with section 33(1)(d) of the *Heritage Act 1977*, has **considered** the submissions received in response to its Notice of Intention to Consider Listing and considers the item known as *Manly Warringah War Memorial Park* at King Street, Manly Vale, to satisfy more than one of the approved criteria for determining whether an item is of State heritage significance, being criteria (a), (b), (c), (d), (e), (f) and (g), as detailed in the report at Tab 4.2A.
2. **Recommends** to the Minister, in accordance with sections 32(1) and (2) of the *Heritage Act 1977*, that the Minister **direct** the listing of the item, *Manly Warringah War Memorial Park* at King Street, Manly Vale, on the State Heritage Register, as shown in the curtilage plan at Tab 4.2C of the report.
3. In accordance with section 33(1)(e) of the *Heritage Act 1977*, **give notice** of its decision to persons notified under section 33(1)(a).
4. In accordance with section 57(2) of the *Heritage Act 1977*, **note** that the Heritage Council Standard Exemptions will apply.
5. In accordance with section 57(2) of the *Heritage Act 1977*, **recommends** that the Minister **grant** the site-specific exemptions at Tab 4.2D of the report from section 57(1) of the *Heritage Act 1977* in addition to the Heritage Council Standard Exemptions.

Moved by Ms Lisa Trueman and seconded by Ms Natalie Vinton

Item 4.3 Toorale Homestead and Woolshed Precincts – RTL

The State Heritage Register Committee noted the update on Toorale Homestead and Woolshed Precincts – RTL by Ms Jackie Taylor and Mr Harvey Johnston.

Key points noted:

- Four submissions were received during the advertising period.
- There was one objection from Bourke Shire Council mainly due to the inclusion of the Toorale Road in the proposed curtilage. Heritage NSW discussed with council having a small section of road to include the entry sign. This would include site-specific exemptions to not limit the council's ability to upgrade or manage the road in the future.
- National Parks and Wildlife Services provided a submission recommending a smaller curtilage (approximately 22 hectares) for the Homestead Precinct. This was to create more identifiable boundary features to allow National Parks to better manage the area.

The Executive Director, Heritage NSW acknowledged the tremendous amount of work that Heritage Programs has done in the last four months under the leadership of Directors Mr Steve Meredith and Ms Anna London.

The Chair thanked Ms Jackie Taylor and Mr Harvey Johnston for the presentation and their hard work on this item, and thanked Heritage NSW staff for their hard work.

Resolution 2022-74
<p>The State Heritage Register Committee:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. In accordance with section 33(1)(d) of the <i>Heritage Act 1977</i>, has considered the submissions received in response to its Notice of Intention to Consider Listing and considers the item known as <i>Toorale Homestead and Woolshed Precincts</i>, within Toorale National Park via Bourke, satisfies more than one of the approved criteria for determining whether an item is of State heritage significance, being criteria a (historical values), b (associations with people or groups of people), c (aesthetic values), d (community esteem), e (research potential), f (rarity), g (representative values), as detailed in the report at Tab 4.3A. 2. Recommends to the Minister, in accordance with sections 32(1) and (2) of the <i>Heritage Act 1977</i>, that the Minister direct the listing of the item, <i>Toorale Homestead and Woolshed Precincts</i>, within Toorale National Park via Bourke, on the State Heritage Register, as shown in the curtilage plan at Tab 4.3C of the report. 3. In accordance with section 33(1)(e) of the <i>Heritage Act 1977</i>, give notice of its decision to persons notified under section 33(1)(a). 4. In accordance with section 57(2) of the <i>Heritage Act 1977</i>, recommends that the Minister grant the site-specific exemptions at Tab 4.3D of the report from section 57(1) of the <i>Heritage Act 1977</i> in addition to the Heritage Council Standard Exemptions.
Moved by Dr Brian Lindsay and seconded by Ms Colleen Morris

Item 5. Matters for Consideration

Item 5.1 Assessing Heritage Significance – Consultation Findings

The State Heritage Register Committee noted the update on Assessing Heritage Significance by Ms Elizabeth Owers and Ms Natalie Vinton.

Key points noted:

- The Assessing Heritage Significance consultation included a 2020 review; interviews with Heritage NSW, Heritage Council, SHRC and ACHAC; Have Your Say public platform; two written feedback rounds; and the Heritage Advisors Network.

- 114 people participated through the Have Your Say public platform and comprised:
 - 71% heritage professionals
 - 7.9% citizens and heritage enthusiasts
 - 5.3% non-heritage organisations
 - 5.3% owners/managers of heritage properties
 - 2.6% heritage organisations
- 36% of respondents use the guidelines more than once a week, and 30% of respondents said the 2001 guidelines do not meet their needs. Concerns included the case studies, gradings of significance, inclusions/exclusions, and heritage significance criteria.
- In December 2022 / January 2023, the final living document will be presented to Heritage NSW, and have an editorial review with the Department of Planning and Environment (DPE) branding team.
- The Executive Director, Heritage NSW will have final approval of the document.
- The refreshed guidelines will be a living document published on the Heritage NSW (DPE Environment and Heritage Group) website.

The Chair thanked Ms Elizabeth Owers and Ms Natalie Vinton for their presentation.

Item 6. Preliminary Assessment of New SHR Nominations

The State Heritage Register Committee noted the presentation on Preliminary Assessment of New SHR Nominations by Ms Sonia Limeburner.

Item 6.1 SHR Nomination – Powerhouse Museum (buildings and collection)

Ms Natalie Vinton left the meeting for the duration of this agenda item.

- The Committee discussed the nomination and resolved to defer its decision.

Resolution 2022-75

The State Heritage Register Committee:

1. Resolved to **defer** its decision on the preliminary assessment of the 2020 National Trust of Australia (NSW) *Powerhouse Museum (buildings and collections)* nomination.

Moved by Dr Brian Lindsay and seconded by Dr Stephen Gapps

Item 6.2 SHR Nomination – Villa Florida, Rose Bay

Ms Lisa Trueman left the meeting for the duration of this agenda item.

- Based on studies that were conducted in response to a DA to demolish the building, Heritage NSW considers the item is unlikely to be of State heritage significance.

Resolution 2022-76

The State Heritage Register Committee:

1. **Considers** that *Villa Florida, Rose Bay* is unlikely to be of State heritage significance and the nomination should not be progressed to an assessment.

Moved by Dr Stephen Gapps and seconded by Dr Brian Lindsay

Item 6.3 SHR Nomination – Australian Chinese Ex-Services Monument, Sydney

Dr Wayne Johnson noted his standing declaration regarding Place Management NSW and advised that he was not aware of Place Management NSW being approached for information regarding listing.

- The monument is owned by Place Management NSW and was built in conjunction with the Chinese community in 2003.
- Heritage NSW advised that the item may be of State heritage significance, as migrant related heritage which is underrepresented on the State Heritage Register, but not a current Heritage Council's priority area.

Resolution 2022-77
The State Heritage Register Committee:
1. Resolves to recommend that a nomination to NSW War Memorial Register be considered for the <i>Australian Chinese Ex-Services Monument, Sydney</i> .
Moved by Dr Brian Lindsay and seconded by Ms Colleen Morris

Item 6.4 SHR Nomination – Anambah House, Gosforth – Curtilage Amendment

The State Heritage Register Committee noted that a request to amend the curtilage of *Anambah House, Gosforth* (SHR #00275) is under assessment and will be presented to the Committee for consideration in early 2023.

The Chair thanked Ms Sonia Limeburner for the report.

Ms Natalie Vinton left the meeting.

Item 7. SHR Listings Monthly Report

The State Heritage Register Committee noted the SHR Listings Monthly Report by Ms Sonia Limeburner.

Item 8. General Matters

The Chair expressed her thanks to all staff of Heritage NSW, Secretariat and Committee members for their hard work through the year and congratulated everyone in getting listings through so quickly.

Committee members thanked Chair Robyn Parker and Deputy Chair Colleen Morris, for their leadership, dedication and hard work this year.

Item 8.1 Forward Agenda

The State Heritage Register Committee noted the report.

Meeting Close

There being no further items of business, Chair Robyn Parker closed the meeting at 1:20 PM.



.....
The Hon. Robyn Parker

Chair, State Heritage Register Committee

Date: 31 January 2023